

Gallery of Modern Art: Evaluation of Rule of Thumb



Executive Summary	3
Introduction	8
Aims and Objectives of Evaluation	9
Our methodology	10
Context: Sanctuary	11
The project model	13
elbowroom	15
Exhibition	17
Media profile	18
Visitor Survey	20
Outreach Projects	22
218	22
HMP Barlinnie	24
Meridian	26
The Young Women's Project	27
Artists	28
Outreach Projects – Summary and Conclusions	29
Education Programme	32
Wider Artist Community	34
Volunteers	35
Stakeholder Views	36
<i>Closing comments</i>	38
APPENDIX A: - CONSULTEES	40



Executive Summary

Rule of Thumb was GoMA's second major exhibition, events and outreach programme highlighting the violation of human rights. Running throughout 2005, it included exhibitions, workshops, events, artists in residence and lectures highlighting violence against women issues. The programme was supported by Amnesty International UK and Rape Crisis Scotland.

The outreach programme:

The outreach programme was very positively received with the expectations of participants overwhelmingly exceeded. Partner organisations remarked upon the thought and foresight that had gone into the programme and recognised the considerable efforts that had been made.

The programme had been developed with great sensitivity and partners commented that the programme had been therapeutic for many of their clients. There had also been real positive outcomes, with clients using the programme as a springboard to accessing further learning opportunities. Group work opportunities had helped build self-confidence and social skills.

Partners felt that the programme was complementary to the existing work and services that they carried out and helped create space for other processes. Barriers that had previously existed had started to come down.

There was gratitude for the opportunities presented and particular commendations for staff and artists who had gone the extra mile.

A number of organisations had actively sourced art interventions after the programme as a direct result of participating.

Artists involved in the programme commented on the gallery's sensitivity in the handling of sensitive issues and valued and appreciated the training that was provided. Although there were challenges in delivering the programme within the available time, they felt themselves to be well-supported and recognised the intrinsic value of having the opportunity to be supported to look at challenging issues in their work.

They also recognised that there had been a "buzz" in the artist community about the programme and the evolving role of the gallery.



Participants were exhibited in GoMA which was in itself a significant motivational factor – giving them a voice in a central public space.

The exhibitions:

The Barbara Kruger exhibition was regarded by many as the “defining element” of the programme. Attracting an artist of international repute to the city within the context of an issues based programme was felt to have lent weight to all other aspects of the programme. The feedback from visitors, evidenced by the visitors book, was outstanding.

The exhibition was a major driver for publicising the wider programme and for ensuring that the issues gained wider media coverage. Impact could be measured in column inches but also by the increased public debate around the issue recognised by the wider stakeholders.

The public exhibition was widely valued as a platform for the work of women’s groups in the city.

The wider programme:

The wider programme was highly regarded within Glasgow City Council and wider stakeholders and was felt to have “delivered”.

Achieving increased awareness and changing attitudes and behaviours is notoriously difficult but there were identifiable success factors which stakeholders felt were attributable, at least in part, to the programme. The public profile and sensitive way in which the issues had been addressed added value to existing services, and were an asset in increasing awareness and understanding of them. There was greater media coverage of the issues. There were more people talking publicly about the issues.

The programme was also felt to have helped redefine the Gallery of Modern Art “product” and to reconnect it to the Glasgow public. GoMA was seen as a venue for people interested in contemporary issues and not necessarily just in contemporary art.

Visitors to the city had identified art and culture – and particularly the accessibility of it – as factors influencing their choice of city break. There was also some evidence of destination tourism where a city visit had been built around a desire to see the exhibition.

Stakeholders were challenged when asked to make comparators with other facilities. It was felt that GoMA’s developing twin approaches –



investing in and supporting contemporary Scottish art and an issues-based arts and social justice programme gave it a distinctive edge. Commentators said that it was now a “live” gallery and that better comparators could be made with European or North American facilities than with UK “competitors”.

Stakeholders were keen to build upon this success. They wanted to continue to add value to the programme and to actively explore what more could be done to interest others. They were keen to expand the programme both in its scale and in the range of opportunities it offered.

There were a number of conclusions to be drawn in considering the future development of the programme.

Rule of Thumb has exceeded expectations in using contemporary art to explore social justice issues

The perceived impact of the programme had exceeded the expectations of both stakeholders and the advisory group. Stakeholders across the City Council held the programme in high esteem and were impressed that the programme had added weight to the ongoing corporate policy work around violence against women. Consultees believed that the programme had delivered on increased public awareness of the issue. Advisory group members were impressed at the quality of product, and the media interest in the subject.

Rule of Thumb has engaged and attracted a wider constituency to the Gallery of Modern Art

Programmes of this nature can help simultaneously build audiences and promote awareness of contemporary issues. Rule of Thumb directly contributed to widening the constituency of GoMA and has been pivotal in recognition of the gallery’s expanding role in civic life. From the visitor surveys, and from details of participants in both the workshop and outreach programmes, it was clear that new audiences had been attracted to the Gallery of Modern Art because of the Rule of Thumb programme. This included both tourists – some of whom cited the programme as a reason for choosing Glasgow as their preferred city-break destination – and local residents.

Rule of Thumb has worked effectively with local partners

Local partners – largely voluntary sector and all dealing with diverse and often challenging client groups – were very positive about the programme and their engagement with it. Many were very honest in acknowledging that they were initially sceptical about the approach, but that they had been impressed with the sensitivity of Gallery staff



and the artists, and that they had found the interventions extremely productive.

In all cases expectations had been effectively managed on all sides and many local projects had sought to develop a continuing arts based programme. Issues of sustainability had been actively considered from the outset and the Gallery had helped direct local partners to continuing council and other services.

Significant effort was made to reach the hardest to reach

The impact on clients has been varied and significant and actively targeted upon many of the hardest to reach. Clients reported a range of positive impacts – therapeutic, supporting the development of soft skills, and introducing learning.

The use of arts has been widely recognised as an effective tool in developing self expression, confidence and communication.

Rule of Thumb has contributed to the re-defining of the Gallery of Modern Art

Respondents reported that both GoMA's commitment to Scottish contemporary art and its programme of work relating to social justice issues makes it "unique". When asked to identify "benchmarks" for the gallery, respondents said that appropriate comparators were international.

Artists, particularly, were encouraged by the direction of the gallery and its clear sense of purpose and positioning within the city.

Local authority champions are important

Champions within the local authority are important for the programme to have sufficient corporate priority. There was evidence of the programme being championed both within the senior management team within the council's Cultural and Leisure Services and within the corporate policy team within the Chief Executive's department.

Role of Social Inclusion Co-ordinator has been key

The commitment to programme across all staff has been of pivotal importance, but the unique role of the Social Inclusion Co-ordinator has been instrumental to the success of the programme. Her co-ordinating function, and her ability to work effectively across curatorial staff, artists, outreach projects and clients has been the lynchpin of the programme's success.

Longer term sustainability

There are two related issues around longer term sustainability. Firstly, the Social Inclusion Co-ordinator was very effective in building ownership within local projects and ensuring that there was a partner responsibility in continuing work beyond the life of the programme.



Secondly, there needs to be continuing – and increasing – investment if this role is to be strengthened. Stakeholders have recognised both the value of the programme and opportunities for expansion.



Introduction

The Gallery of Modern Art (GoMA) leads an arts based social inclusion strategy for Glasgow City Council. In partnership with other arts and voluntary organisations in Glasgow, and local, national and international agencies, a biennial cycle of programmes have been developed as part of this strategy to tackle key social issues which are high on the city's agenda.

The main aims of the programme are:

- To raise awareness of Glasgow residents to social justice issues by providing the opportunity to visit international quality events and exhibitions in their own city
- To give people from excluded groups opportunities to develop new issue based arts work to show in major city centre venues.
- The Rule of Thumb programme will offer volunteer placements within the service giving women the opportunity to develop skills and confidence.
- To counteract negative media portrayal of social justice issues by showing that current issues are not new and that Glasgow has a long history of engaging with these and similar problems.

The biennial series launched in 2003 with *Sanctuary: Contemporary art and human rights* which highlighted asylum seekers and refugees. In 2005 *Rule of Thumb: Contemporary art and human rights* focused on violence against women. The 2007 programme will focus on sectarianism and had the working title of *A City Divided*.

Paul Zealey Associates Ltd (pza) was commissioned by the gallery to carry out an evaluation of Rule of Thumb with the specific objective:

To review and assess how well the programme achieves its main aims, including its impact on visitors, participants and partner organisations and the effectiveness of the overall programme in meeting the aims of Glasgow City Council and the objectives of GoMA's forward plan.



Aims and Objectives of Evaluation

The broad aim of this study is:

To review and assess how well the programme achieves its main aims, including its impact on visitors, participants and partner organisations and the effectiveness of the overall programme in meeting the aims of Glasgow City Council and the objectives of GoMA's forward plan.

The specific objectives of this report are:

- To make recommendations for the ongoing development of the programme to ensure the most effective structure for GoMA and GCC in developing future programmes
- To research, collate and analyse information relating to three key areas of the programme: Outreach Projects; the Exhibition and the Overall programme:

Outreach Projects

- Gather participants, artist and host organisations feedback on the outreach projects
- Assess the range of impact on participants, including any increased awareness of and visits to arts and museum venues

Exhibitions

- Gather visitor feedback on the exhibition and programme as well as the education and supporting events
- Assess any change in awareness and/ or attitude of visitors towards the subject; and visitor appreciation of the quality of art on display

Overall Programme

- Gather feedback from key partner organisations, GoMA staff and Glasgow City Council, including perceptions of the strengths and weaknesses of the programme
- Review the context of the programme in terms of existing programmes in Glasgow and nationally.
- Make recommendation for the ongoing development of the programme including operational models
- Review the design, marketing and publicity of the exhibition and events



This report therefore:

- Assesses how well the programme has achieved its aims
- Assesses the impact on visitors, participants and partner organisations
- Assesses the effectiveness of the overall programme in meeting the aims of Glasgow City Council and the objectives of GoMA's forward plan
- Makes recommendations for the ongoing development of the programme including operational models

Our methodology

This review has been based upon:

Desk research

- Review of the pilot project evaluation report
- Review of the context and legacy of the programme

Consultation

- Interviews and surveys with a range of participants, staff, officers and visitors.
- Outreach projects: participants, artists and group co-ordinators
- Face to face interviews with staff members and participants
- GoMA and Programme staff
- Face to face interviews
- Visitors and audiences
- Combination of review of self - completed survey forms and review of the comments book entries completed by visitors
- Relevant staff at partner and funding organisations
- Facilitated session followed up where necessary by telephone interviews
- Wider art community
- Focus group

Context: Sanctuary

Sanctuary was the first in the biennial series of arts and social inclusion programmes. It developed as a programme with two aims:

- To use a high profile exhibition to raise awareness of the plight of asylum seekers and refugees worldwide, to redress negative media portrayal and local public perception
- To offer the new residents [asylum seekers housed in Glasgow under the dispersal programme] access to local arts services.

The specific objectives of *Sanctuary* were to:

- Provide a fully accessible programme of participatory workshops for members of the asylum seeker and refugee community in the city over an extended period of time (14 months), developed to complement the GoMA Sanctuary exhibition held between April and September 2003.
- Provide a complementary programme of exhibitions and events for the asylum seeker and refugee community and for Glasgow's indigenous population in GoMA in partnership with other arts venues.
- Form lasting relationships with voluntary and community organisations working with and for the asylum seeker and refugee community.
- Build upon existing Glasgow City Council Culture and Leisure Services (CLS) initiatives with asylum seekers and refugees (including the work of Libraries, the Open Museum, and the Arts Development and Community Action Teams).

An internal evaluation of Sanctuary was carried out. This reported on a short film commissioned as a record of the programme, the experience of individuals participating in the outreach projects, and the visitor survey which had been completed by visitors to the final exhibition at GoMA.

The evaluations key findings were:

- A higher number of people participated in the workshops than had been anticipated – over 755 people took part, double the proposed 220 – 440.
- Groups involved in the outreach workshops noted that people attended more regularly and stayed for longer periods when the workshops were being held.
- It was hard to attract young people aged 16-25, and workshops aimed at this group tended to be more poorly attended.



- Project co-ordinators were essential to the success of workshops, both in arranging them and in promoting them to their clients.
- Over 40 events and workshops were held at GoMA during Sanctuary. These were generally well attended.
- The age range of participants was broad, with schools workshops ensuring a high number of under 12 year olds in particular.
- Participants from over 24 countries took part.
- The majority of participants had not visited the Gallery of Modern Art before, although many had visited one of the Glasgow Museums before.
- It was concluded that Sanctuary had worked with participants who were not traditional museum / gallery goers, and therefore had reached people who would not otherwise have attended the exhibition.

The visitor survey summary report prepared for Sanctuary by the University of Leicester details the results of 300 self – completed visitor surveys which were returned in April and May 2003. Key findings were:

- 41% of returns were from people who ‘came from’ Glasgow, and 22% from the rest of Scotland
- 33% were first time visitors to GoMA, and 44% had specifically gone to GoMA to visit Sanctuary.

The evaluation concluded that the Sanctuary programme had been very successful in achieving a number of its aims:

- It provided a fully accessible programme of participatory workshops for members of the asylum seeker and refugee community in the city over an extended period of time in addition to a complementary programme of exhibitions and events for the asylum seeker and refugee community and for Glasgow’s indigenous population, in GoMA and in partnership with other city-centre arts venues
- Contact was established with a number of groups across the city.
- The feedback from outreach projects was very positive and encouraging for future work to be developed.
- The marketing of the programme was a major issue, and a number of comments had highlighted that people had not known about events.

211,889 people visited the Sanctuary exhibition. 3,058 people from 28 countries participated in outreach workshops and events.



The project model

There were a number of different aspects to the *Rule of Thumb* programme:

elbowroom

elbowroom was a leading exhibition showing group work from an eight month outreach art project. This was an opportunity to pilot new approaches to outreach and participatory activity. The exhibition was viewed as a “lead-in” to the main programme, and helped to start building audiences.

The Exhibition

A unique installation prepared for the programme by Barbara Kruger, exhibiting in Scotland for the first time.

Outreach Participatory Programme

Eight outreach participatory arts projects with groups across Glasgow; partnership with other museums and arts venues to deliver an innovative range of exhibitions, performances and events highlighting violence against women issues, and link up with other areas of CLS to develop pathways out of social exclusion for the individuals and groups we will be working with.

Education Programme

- A resource space was provided in Gallery 4 to support the Barbara Kruger exhibition
- Workshops for adults, teenagers and children responding to the exhibition, including:
 - Self defence workshops
 - Music workshops
 - Drama workshops
 - Poetry workshops (adult workshop)
 - Writing workshop
 - Jewellery workshop (aimed at teenagers)
- Theatre and music performances, book readings and a series of lectures about Barbara Kruger
- A schools programme including Teachers preview, set of teachers notes, and school workshops for primary and secondary pupils
- Artist in residence at GoMA for June with exhibition in August and September
- Community group workshops



Project Timeline

Planning began	2003
Advisory Group established	2003
Rule of Thumb outreach exhibition	July – September 2004
Groups identified for Rule of Thumb outreach projects	October – December 2004
Advertise for artists for Rule of Thumb outreach projects	By December 2004
elbowroom participatory projects	February 2004
elbowroom exhibition	December 2004 – February 2005
Plan timetable of workshops and events	January – March 2005
Rule of Thumb outreach workshops begin	23 March 2005
Barbara Kruger exhibition opens at GoMA	21 April 2005
Artist in Residence in GoMA studio	June 2005
Work resulting from Artist in Residence in Balcony Gallery	July – September 2005
Barbara Kruger exhibition opens at Tramway	4 August 2005
Barbara Kruger Exhibitions close	21 September 2005
Last outreach workshops complete	February 2006
Rule of Thumb outreach exhibition	February – June 2006

elbowroom

As a lead in to the 2004–2005 Rule of Thumb programme, elbowroom was a group exhibition showing work from an eight month outreach art project. elbowroom both helped build awareness of the programme but also piloted a new model for participation projects offering extended time, resources and supervision for artists. The project was funded by Glasgow City Council, the Scottish Arts Council Lottery Fund and the North Glasgow Healthy Living Initiative.

GoMA initiated partnerships between the organisations: Red Road Women's Centre, Glasgow Women's Library, Glasgow Women's Aid and Base 75 and artists: Rachel Mimiec, Anne Elliot, Katie Bruce, and Janice Sharp.

Through workshops, events, consultations and research, everyone participating in the project fed into and developed new artworks that incorporate issues relating to violence against women.

The exhibition opened during the UN 16 Days of Action for the elimination of violence against women and was supported by workshops, talks and events.

In-house monitoring highlighted the difficulties of carrying out ongoing evaluation when working with the client groups identified. In some organisations contact with clients varied from week to week and it was not possible to track results of interventions meaningfully. This flags up the nature of the vulnerable groups who were worked with and the very real challenges that this offers to artists.

Comments received in evaluations carried out with participants in the outreach workshops were extremely positive. Participants and the project staff were positive about the programme, the achievements and the new audience it had allowed their clients to reach.

Staff at the projects were extremely positive about the project and its wider outcomes:

"Inspirational, creative and highly fulfilling project which groundbreakingly gave a voice to the most excluded citizens in Glasgow – women involved in prostitution"

The impact upon visitors was also evident. Comments received in the elbowroom comments books were very powerful and included:



"After going through domestic abuse, I found reading the small booklets interesting and glad that this issue is being shown to the public"

"Rarely touched and moved like this. My thoughts are with you."

"This is the first exhibition which has made me cry in a long time. Its not right for them its not right for us."

"An exhibition that has truth, honesty and value at the heart of it. I wish more exhibitions were like this."

Recognition

The elbowroom programme was an award winning project in the engage Scotland Visual Arts Education Awards 2005 – "Creativity and Well-being". The Scottish Executive response to the Cultural Commission Report uses the elbowroom comment book as evidence for how the arts can contribute to awareness and debate on social issues – and that there is value in different responses to artworks. The report cites elbowroom (and very few other arts projects):

"Working through strong community connections, experienced artists and committed participants gave expressive shape to shared and personal issues, negotiating strong, instinctive responses to a big public issue –violence against women".

Exhibition

Attracting Barbara Kruger for her first exhibition in Scotland was recognised as a major coup for GoMA. The exhibition was the centrepiece of Rule of Thumb and Kruger's work was a major draw and impetus for discourse on the programme theme.

Kruger's reputation is founded upon combining images with text to confront the viewer with issues of power and control in relation to sexuality and politics and the exhibition at GoMA featured a new installation utilising the walls, floor, columns and skylight window areas of the top floor gallery. It was an inspired choice.

It was complemented by a specially commissioned billboard exhibited for one month at Glasgow Central Station and her video installation, Twelve, at Tramway.

Barbara Kruger was a highlight of the Glasgow International visual arts programme. MAP Magazine wrote about "the unexpected and heady union of aesthetics and power" in this year's Glasgow International programme. "It represents an unbelievably self-confident, dramatic and unified debut. These are truly universal concerns, subtle and potent in their all-pervasiveness. Barbara Kruger's installation... embodies this."

The main exhibition was pivotal in ensuring weight to the social justice programme, and was particularly important in securing media interest and partnerships with other venues.

The only slightly disappointing aspect was that GoMA was unable to secure an artist commission or purchase as had been originally planned. This was due to the pressures of needing to secure agreement within the rigours of a local authority financial year.

Media profile

Press

Both Rule of Thumb and elbowroom received significant press coverage, both in arts media and in mainstream news articles. The coverage received cannot be directly compared with Sanctuary, as a press clippings service was used which recorded all listings.

elbowroom

elbowroom press tended towards reviews of the exhibitions and arts news. For this exhibition, and the groups whose work was being exhibited, being reviewed on the same level as a professional art exhibition was a recognition of quality:

"A chilling but unmissable exhibition...An installation which, for all its lack of individual authorship, is as worthy of the Turner Prize as the most recent submissions of Kutlag Ataman and Jeremy Dellar."

Rule of Thumb

Barbara Kruger was a significant draw for some publications. Interviews were published in the List, Scotsman and Big Issue. These were printed in both arts sections and news sections of these publications. Coverage highlighted both the artist and the issue:

"Barbara Kruger's installation (forces) the viewer to literally take a stand on the issues surrounding domestic abuse and violent acts of misogyny. The graphic and text-based work is unrelenting, dominating those passing through the room. The use of green and white, and the enormous amount of light that floods into the space make everyone look so alive, but the mood remains sombre. Silence and serious introspection descend."

The significant articles are noted overleaf.

Press coverage – elbowroom and Rule of Thumb

<i>Date</i>	<i>Paper</i>	<i>Type of article</i>	<i>Size</i>	<i>Focus of piece?</i>
01/07/2005	Evening Times	News	Short - 3 inch 1 column	Art award - Engage Scotland
20/01/2005	The List	Top 15 things to see - visual arts	1 paragraph p4, also 1 paragraph p 92	Elbowroom @ GoMA
02/01/2005	Sunday Herald	Listings, choice	1 paragraph p 37	Elbowroom
07/12/2004	Metro	Arts news	1 paragraph	Elbowroom
16/01/2005	Scotland on Sunday	Review	Full 1/2 page, p 12	Elbowroom
20/01/2005	The List	Review 4*	1/2 paragraph page, p 93	Elbowroom
09/01/2005	Sunday Herald	Review 4*	4 wide columns, 1/3 page, p 25	Elbowroom
02/04/2005	Herald	Arts preview	Few mentions in general article - magazine p 3	Rule of Thumb
	Metro	Review 4*	1/2 page	Rule of Thumb
21/04/2005	Herald	News / preview	1/2 page	R o T - Barbara Kruger
14/04/2005	The List	Interview	2 pages	R o T - Barbara Kruger
12/04/2005	Scotsman	Interview	2 pages	R o T - Barbara Kruger
07/04/2005	Big Issue	Preview / Interview	3 pages +	R o T - Barbara Kruger
26/04/2005	Scotsman	Arts Review ****	2 pages	R o T - Barbara Kruger
21/04/2005	Evening Times	News	1/2 page	Use of Evening Times front page in exhibition

Visitor Survey

A short survey was carried out with visitors to the Rule of Thumb exhibition. A report on this survey was then prepared by student researchers from the University of Newcastle upon Tyne. The methodology for gathering information was similar to that of the surveys carried out for Sanctuary: a self – completed questionnaire located throughout the exhibition and handed in to response boxes. 300 questionnaires were completed.

The questionnaire sought general visitor information about:

- The visitor profile
- Visitor attendance
- Marketing resources
- Visitor awareness of public outreach programmes
- The visitor opinion and response.

Visitor Profile

66% of visitors were female, 34% male
46% lived in Glasgow
17% elsewhere in Scotland
12% were from England and 25% were international

Reason for Visit

39% had visited GoMA specifically to see the Barbara Kruger exhibition.

28% had visited for the subject matter
12% for Barbara Kruger (artist showing)
23% for both the above
34% were just passing

Awareness

71% of visitors were not aware of the outreach programmes and events running in conjunction with the exhibition.
73% had no prior awareness of the bi-annual social justice programme.

Open Questions

Three 'open' questions were asked to elicit visitor opinions and reactions:

- What are your reactions to the Barbara Kruger Exhibition?
- What do you think of the accompanying response space?
- GoMA plans to work with issues of social justice and human rights every two years. Do you have any opinions or suggestions about the future programming?

1. What are your reactions to the Barbara Kruger Exhibition?

This question received a range of responses, praising the power of the exhibition, the effectiveness of it, and detailing their personal responses.

2. What do you think of the accompanying response space?

The response space was welcomed, although a number of the returns were in fact relating to the whole exhibition.

3. GoMA plans to work with issues of social justice and human rights every two years. Do you have any opinions or suggestions about the future programming?

Responses to this question focuses either on the desirability of a Social Justice / Human Rights programme or made a variety of suggestions for the topic of the next programme.

Comments received in the general visitor comments books were also very positive, although there was a significant minority 'backlash' against the perceived ignorance of the issue of violence against men, with some male visitors feeling victimised or excluded by the focus of the exhibition. The comments books were very well used, far more so than for other exhibitions, and this was also commented on by visitors.

Comments included:

"This moved me and helped me to realise that I was in a destructive cycle with a friend"

"I am living in a Women's Aid Refuge with my three children – this exhibition showed me I am not alone....."

"...it has made me open up my eyes to what my ex boyfriend has put me through... thank you for helping me to wake up"
Viviane, 15

"I already signed this once, but I returned to view it again and it made even more sense. Now I have cast off the friend who was verbally & physically abusing me. I hadn't realised until I hear other women's accents and saw the exhibition that I was being abused. Thank you."

"This is the best comments book I have ever seen."

Outreach Projects

218

218 is a service for women offenders. Based in Glasgow, it offers a range of services designed to address the root cause of offending for women in Glasgow who are caught in the criminal justice system (in prison / ex prisoners or facing prosecution), to help women break the cycle which results in the "revolving door" syndrome that characterises many of their relationships with prison.

The artists, Anne Elliot, Jan Nimmo and Michelle Naismith, worked closely with the staff and participants to develop a programme which addressed the needs of the clients. Sessions were well attended by a mixture of some constant attendees and some women who attended only a few sessions. Activities and art forms delivered varied, including some projects which ran over a number of weeks and required staying power from clients, and others which were single sessions. A four week puppet making project was highly rated by participants and staff. The focus throughout was on expressing feelings and self expression, which were felt to be key to the client groups issues.

Clients

Workers at 218 reported that the key impacts of the programme on their clients were the opportunities which it developed - to discuss issues in a safe environment, to learn, to explore, and to grow personally.

Interviews carried out with clients found that they had been attracted to the workshops for different reasons – to explore an existing interest in drawing,, to learn how to express feelings, and as a distraction activity for one client with a drug use history. The impacts of the programme on clients were felt to be extremely positive. One client reported that she used the skills she had learned in workshops to try and make things on her own at home.

There was significant interest in continuing to learn artistic skills and possibly take it further.

"Lot in my head as I drew what I felt and it helped"

Organisation

Staff at 218 were extremely positive about the programme, which clearly addressed their needs and those of their clients. It allowed them to offer an additional service to their clients, and the theme of



violence against women had a very close fit with the issues faced by participants.

Staff particularly praised the artists approach to group work, which they found very different to their more structured approach but had been successful with their clients.

HMP Barlinnie

Barlinnie Prison receives male prisoners from courts across Scotland, mainly in the West. It retains all remand prisoners and adult convicted prisoners serving less than four years. Over 1,100 men are regularly imprisoned in Barlinnie.

The prison has a number of educational and vocational programmes. The Social Inclusion Co-ordinator spent over six months working with staff to arrange details of the programme before the provision of these workshops was agreed. The workshops were delivered at the Employment Links premises in Barlinnie, with the support of Employment Links staff.

Two artists - James McLardy and Magi Gibson - are based at Barlinnie, holding separate workshops on visual art and writing. Due to the long process involved in arranging these sessions, the Barlinnie workshops began later than others, and ran to the end of January 2006.

Clients

The key staff involved at the prison reported that the key impacts on the prisoners were:

Confidence. A number of the men involved are clients of the prisons stress centre – they lack confidence and the ability to speak out. Prison itself is a very extreme environment and many clients began the sessions without the confidence to speak in their cells or halls. The welcoming atmosphere – both of the employment links centre and the workshops in particular – gave clients the opportunity to speak in sessions and build the confidence to speak to other inmates.

The clients themselves reported a number of practical and personal impacts from the workshops, varying from client to client. One participant in the writing workshops planned to write a novel, and was using the tutor to help with the writing process. The visual art workshop participants were enthusiastic about their learning and development:

"I look forward to it every week"

Organisation

Staff feedback was positive. In particular, they highlighted the benefits of the workshops being recreational. Most other training / educational opportunities available in both the Employment Links unit and the Education Service are academic or vocational. There are very few opportunities for clients to take part in artistic activities. As a number of the clients suffer from the effects of alcohol or drugs



misuse, the value of any activity which engages the prisoners minds and gives them a focus for the time in their cells is invaluable.

"gives them a chance to reflect"



Meridian

Meridian aims to empower black and minority ethnic women who suffer from physical, psychological, economic and emotional abuse to identify, plan and achieve for themselves. Services provided include advice and information, training and employment, counselling, health initiatives, leisure classes, drop-in facilities, childcare and playscheme.

Meridian staff were involved in the Advisory Group which lead on the Rule of Thumb project. Clients were canvassed in advance on the types of workshop which they would like to attend, and music was the most frequently mentioned. Music workshops were held, initially with a selected group of women who had experienced violence, but as some clients moved on others began to attend and the group changed in membership.

The artists were Aby Vulliamy and Jane McNally

Clients

The staff at Meridian felt that the key impacts of the programme on their clients were increased confidence; the therapeutic impact of music; the increased openness in groups due to the group work, and the fact that participants have become empowered to take part. The workshops were seen as a first step for clients towards greater involvement in activities.

Clients interviewed were positive about the workshops. The greatest impact it had made on the participants present on the day Meridian was visited was the sense of integration into Scottish life for people who had not lived in Scotland for long. Participants were extremely enthusiastic about learning traditional Scottish music and music appreciation skills.

Organisation

Meridian staff were enthusiastic about the workshops. In particular, art complemented the other courses which they offer, most of which are practical or vocational (ESL, sewing, IT). For some clients, learning any new skill is a major step forwards and this programme provided that opportunity for their clients.

The Young Women's Project

The Young Women's Project is a Glasgow City Council Social Work programme which works with vulnerable young women who have experienced abuse or are at risk of abuse. The plan for the workshop programme was developed by the artists and staff with consultation with clients. The artists - Janie Nicoll and Alex Hetherington - managed significant concerns which the project staff held over the security and confidentiality of their clients.

Clients

Due to the vulnerable nature of the group, the clients were not spoken to during the course of this evaluation. Paper questionnaires were given to the project to distribute to participants, three of which were returned.

The surveys returned from clients were positive about their experience. Highly rated aspects of the workshops were the time spent making items and representations of the participants names. It was also felt that the workshops were "different from other groups I have attended" and it was also "good to get out of the unit".

The staff at the project felt that the impacts that involvement in Rule of Thumb had had on their clients included getting clients who had no prior interest in art working creatively and carrying out different art projects; breaking down the barriers which existed between the young women and art / art galleries. The sense of achievement from the works produced and the confidence this has encouraged were also cited.

Organisation

The Young Women's Project have very strict procedures for programmes involving their clients. The staff had concerns about fitting a more free – flowing arts workshop into their structures, but were broadly positive about the programme and its results.

Artists

Five artists delivering various elbowroom and Rule of Thumb workshops were interviewed.

Most artists had felt concerns before the project started about working with the client groups and relating to the theme of Violence Against Women. However, the training which was arranged by GoMA was rated extremely highly and all artists interviewed valued the support they had received from the GoMA team and particularly the Social Inclusion Co-ordinator.

Issues raised by the artists generally related to space or practical restrictions within the project premises – some sessions were held in very small rooms, sometimes moved at short notice. There were also a number of problems highlighted with council processes – for example, one artist took three months to get paid. Some also stated that the rate of pay for this work was lower to other similar contract times, often due to travel time / costs and preparation time. All the artists interviewed praised GoMA staff for all their work and support, which was highly valued.

Sessions had been arranged to allow artists working on different projects to meet and network. Those who were able to attend these sessions found them useful, but others were unable to attend due to travel time and other restrictions.

Outreach Projects – Summary and Conclusions

Clients

Involvement in the Rule of Thumb outreach programme was universally felt to be a positive experience for participants. The disparate types of project and client mean that there were a number of unique impacts on particular clients. For example, a participant recovering from drug addiction found the diversion useful to keeping her mind away from drugs. Some clients in Barlinnie found that their work in workshops gave them something to think about from week to week, an occupation to pass time while in their cells. Another benefit to Barlinnie participants was that the workshops gave them something concrete to tell their families about at visits, a conversation topic which made their visits flow more easily.

Key impacts on clients were:

Confidence and self esteem

Participants and staff members felt that participants had increased their self confidence and ability to speak out in groups as a result both of their accomplishments in the group sessions art work and of the group work taking place:

"I'm just a prisoner, not an artist. But to maybe see my work in a gallery – that's an achievement in itself."

An introduction to the arts and art galleries

The majority of participants surveyed had not taken part in any art activities before, and a majority would be interested in continuing to do some form of creative work. A large number also said that participating had encouraged them to visit GoMA, particularly those who had produced works which may be exhibited in GoMA.

Diversiory

Some clients with particular issues rated the diversion of the workshops as a significant benefit.

*"Another thing to do to keep me occupied / to stay distracted"
"when I go home I try and make wee things Christmassy, sparkling"
"something to do, look forward to"*

Enjoyment

"It's the only thing ... there aren't any deadlines or guidelines. No-one's rushing you to get something done"



Learning

For many of those taking part, these workshops were their first experience of learning something new for a number of years. Staff in the projects believed that it could act as a stepping stone or gateway for some clients into further learning, and many were interested in learning more and carrying on with their works.

Therapy

The emphasis placed by artists in the sessions on expression and enabling participants to express their feelings more effectively had significant therapeutic value for some clients.

"It shows people that they are not alone, that other people experience violence and it's not their fault."

"elbowroom also brought women together to support each other"

Issues raised

None of the clients interviewed raised any issues about the management, content, or operation of the outreach workshops. Comments were limited to hopes for extension of the programme, wishes for longer or more frequent workshops, or a bigger room for the sessions.

Organisations

Staff from organisations participating in the programme were positive about the project, its management, and the processes involved. Some workers engaging with extremely vulnerable women stated that they had been doubtful at the beginning of the programme about the approach taken as the fairly unstructured leadership of artists differed from their practice of groupwork. However, they were positive about the results and the impact of these sessions on their clients.

Key impacts on participating organisations were:

Increasing the portfolio of services

The workshops offered tended to differ from existing services delivered by the organisations. They extended the services offered and potentially increased their client base. For some organisations, the workshops provided a different type of programme from their usual vocational skills/ practical skills/ access / educational courses.

Altered perceptions

Some staff interviewed admitted to having changed their position on the benefits of arts workshops. They had been convinced by their experience of elbowroom and / or Rule of Thumb that creative skills and the arts could be beneficial and appropriate for their clients, that qualified and experienced artists could be sourced to work with specialised client groups, and that there could be significant impacts from these workshops. Organisations were extremely positive about



the qualifications and experience of the artists they had worked with, although they were often surprised that such suitable practitioners could be found working in the arts.

Fit with aims of organisations

The organisations and clients worked with were selected for their relevance to the theme of Violence Against Women. The content of workshops delivered was felt to be a good fit with the broader aims of the participating organisations and the needs of the clients.

Education Programme

The education programme which ran with Rule of Thumb was the largest GoMA have held to date. £16,000 was available from the programme budget to run over 50 workshops, the response space, residency programme and schools programme. The number of workshops organised required freelancers to be used to facilitate in addition to the 2.5 learning assistants and education officer.

There were a number of elements to the programme:

	No. events	No. Visitors
Group Workshops aimed at adults	19	90
Group Workshops aimed at teenagers	13	51
Group Workshops aimed at children	13	362
Open events and artist talks	8	165
Workshops aimed at the visually impaired	2	13
Community Group visits	7	70
BSL tours	1	12
Artist in residence	2	32
Schools programme	17	350
TOTAL	82	1145

The education programme was run in addition to the usual regular school visits to GoMA. Some of the workshops aimed at children were held as the Saturday Art Club which happens weekly. The majority of the workshops held were additional to the standard gallery programmes.

A sample of Evaluation forms from all elements of the education programme were reviewed. All are positive, particularly those from people involved in working with the artist in residence:

"He changed my opinion a bit and got me thinking that maybe there are good men out there. He was the first connection that I have had with a man that is not a blood relative."

This was the most ambitious education programme GoMA has organised. Upon reflection, staff felt that there were too many workshops, and the management time involved in running these with the regular programme was unsustainable.

The theme of Violence Against Women was difficult to manage. Some community group visits were harrowing for visitors and the learning assistants. It was also difficult to programme workshop activities for

primary school children, although once a format was decided on these workshops were highly rated.



Wider Artist Community

A session was held with some artists who are involved in the visual arts in Glasgow to gather their perceptions on the programme as a whole, on the exhibitions in particular, the impact the Social Justice programme has had on GoMA, and any comments or suggestions on the programme.

Perceptions

There were concerns about the concept of themed programmes. Art works are generally less specific than a single theme, and some participants had seen the Barbara Kruger exhibition as being 'art within a Violence Against Women Season'. Some had had initial concerns about the theme, as it could have excluded the issues of violence against men, children, and same-sex couple violence, but it was accepted that in practice the scope of work was broader. It was also felt that biennial programmes were too tight a schedule for the long term.

Barbara Kruger Exhibition

The Barbara Kruger exhibition was rated extremely highly by the artists. It was felt to be a success to get someone of Barbara Kruger's stature and reputation to exhibit in Glasgow. It was also felt that Barbara's media background had increased media interest in the exhibitions as it gave journalists a 'hook' to write about.

Artist Community Attitudes to GoMA

It was felt that the attitude of artists and the wider artistic community in Glasgow to the Gallery of Modern Art had changed in recent years. This change was attributed to the changed purchasing policy of GoMA and their investment in artists. The themed Social Justice work was felt to have contributed to an image of GoMA as a lively exciting gallery.

Recommendations for Sectarianism Programme

Participants felt that Sectarianism was a fascinating subject, but that it should be kept as broad as possible, involving international examples, and should avoid being parochial.

Volunteers

A series of volunteer placements was arranged for clients of organisations involved in the Rule of Thumb advisory group and the outreach programme. Placements took the form of two day 'taster' placements, offering the opportunity to find out about working in an area of interest. Placements were available across Glasgow Museums in the admin, retail, education and front of house areas. Volunteers were given a mentor / supervisor during their placement.

While 48 placements were offered, only 11 were taken up, largely due to location issues (volunteers preferred local opportunities while Glasgow Museum locations are citywide). Administration was the most popular area of placement requested, but as all admin placements were located at the Glasgow Museums Resource Centre in South Nitshill Industrial Estate, fewer were taken up than had been planned. Retail and Front of House were not popular placements.

Other issues impacting take-up of the opportunity were that while many projects said they had clients who would be interested, only one followed this interest up by providing contact details. While the two – day format had been actively selected to provide an easy introduction, some projects felt a longer term placement would have been more successful. The lack of childcare/ crèche facilities was also a problem.

Operational issues included the difficulty in claiming expenses for participants (as expenses were managed centrally, not refunded at the placement venue only one person claimed their costs back); the difficulty in persuading partners to signpost participants clearly; and the need to ensure that internal staff are all aware of the programme. This had been done with the admin team, and led to the particular success of the admin placements.

Five of the volunteers continued their involvement beyond the original two day term, two of whom are still involved. One moved into employment.

Stakeholder Views

We interviewed a variety of stakeholders who had had different roles in the planning and development of the programme. This section draws out some of their comments.

Significant achievements

Respondents were as one in their identification of the most significant achievement of the programme: "What is fantastic is that the issue has been given such a strong profile", said one respondent. Another described it as a "new and innovative way to bring (the issues) to the attention of people who wouldn't necessarily be aware of it or meet people affected by it".

Attracting the Barbara Kruger exhibition was recognised as pivotal and was seen as a real coup for the gallery. In some commentator's views this was the factor that helped the programme exceed expectations.

Winning and sustaining directorate support for the programme was also seen as a significant achievement.

Increasing visitor numbers – and bringing new audiences to the gallery – were also highly regarded. Visitor numbers for GoMA in 2005 have been between 45 – 55,000 per month – far higher than 2004's 25 – 30,000 per month. In 2004 there were 349,734 visits to GoMA. At the time of writing, the gallery was on track to have more than 500,000 in 2005.

The programme was also felt to have made the council's corporate commitment to the issue "more real".

What has not worked well?

In general there were not significant negative comments, one recognising that "that the organisers had learned from the Sanctuary programme."

There were two minor points raised. One was about the "low-key" profile of work from the outreach programme. The second was on how partner agencies can get better at recording people's accessing of services.

There had been challenges with the marketing of the programme with different planned approaches by the gallery and by CLS's marketing officer.



Wider impacts

In general, stakeholders valued the programme because it brought in other partners they wouldn't normally work with evidenced spin-offs. There was recognition of the role of art as a means to engagement and cultural expression and likely wider benefits.

It was recognised that it might be too early to tell on outreach work but there were encouraging indicators that the programme had achieved both an increase in using the arts to advance confidence and self-expression in vulnerable groups, and that the programme and profile had increased public awareness of issues around violence against women.

Joint working had also had wider benefits for other venues. Tramway acknowledged that the Rule of Thumb programme – and the parallel Barbara Kruger installation at Tramway - had increased their audience.

Closing comments

Much has been written about the economic and social importance of the arts but there can be few such concrete examples of how the arts really can make a difference as the Gallery of Modern Art's social justice programme.

The economic impact is threefold. Firstly, the Gallery has invested resources in artists themselves. Commissioning workshops and residencies from Scottish artists growing in stature adds weight to the gallery's aim to support and purchase Scottish contemporary art. Secondly, the workshops and residencies have engaged and challenged some of Glasgow's most excluded citizens. Engagement and involvement in productive activity are early steps on the ladder to employability and employment. Thirdly, the gallery is important to a city economy which is ambitious in extending its attractiveness as both a tourism destination and as a city that can attract and retain fresh talent. A vibrant arts programme and flourishing creative industries are widely recognised as indicators of this. GoMA's reinvention as a facility that nurtures contemporary Scottish talent and which promotes creative responses to pressing social issues has re-established its credibility with both the artist community and city partners.

The social impact is similarly important. Clients involved in outreach and residencies, schools and community organisations involved in the wider programme, have all been exposed to how the arts can help foster self-confidence, creativity and communication – essential soft skills in today's world. For those clients directly affected by the issues addressed it has had therapeutic and other benefits. For some it has been a catalytic influence in taking important decisions about their own life and the acceptability of violence or abuse within it. For those interested in promoting a message to a wider public, the programme has been effective in ensuring that the issues are aired, awareness is increased and that the general public are more aware of the choices open to them. The subjects under discussion – asylum, domestic violence, sectarianism – are both brave and vital.

For the gallery itself, the question must be how to capitalise upon this and consolidate its position as a leader in its field. There is no question that resources were tight and that a relatively modest staff team were under pressure to deliver a very ambitious and wide ranging programme. There are already many learning points identified which have already been adopted.



GoMA has shown that the twin approach of nurturing Scottish contemporary art and highlighting contemporary social issues is a model and formula that works for Glasgow at this time. Wider stakeholders have valued what GoMA has been uniquely able to achieve. The notoriously fickle Glasgow artist community is learning to love its gallery once again. The economic and social impact of its programme is being recognised. Expectations are running high. To deliver effectively it needs adequately resourced.

Our final remarks lay down a challenge to the city. Is Glasgow prepared to build upon what has been learnt from this programme? Is it willing to invest more significantly and with a commitment over a longer time period to consolidate GoMA's emerging reputation as a home for contemporary Scottish art and a crucible for art and social change? Rule of Thumb demonstrated what wider impact could be achieved from fairly modest targeted resources under the stewardship of dynamic, creative and entrepreneurial key individuals.

By moving beyond considering the programme as short-term and by formally recognising and investing in arts and social justice as one important part of the gallery's mainstream offering, Glasgow will have a new cultural asset: a resource that both promotes the best of Scottish talent and challenges unfairness and inequality in Scotland.

APPENDIX A: - CONSULTEES

GoMA Staff	Structured Meeting and Interviews
Katie Bruce	Social Inclusion Co-ordinator
Sean McGlashan	Curator of Contemporary Art
Victoria Hollows	Museum Manager
Ben Harman	Curator of Contemporary Art
Alicia Vanner	Education & Access Curator

Glasgow Museums / Glasgow City Council Meetings and Telephone Interviews

Barbara Keenan	Marketing officer
Mark O' Neill	Head of Museums and Galleries
Charles Bell	Arts Development Manager
Lorraine Wilson	Visual Arts Officer, Tramway
Will McKay	Sports and Leisure
Jean Murphy	Chief Executive Office

Advisory Group	Facilitated Meeting
Anne Marie Mullaney	Social Work
Rosemary Burnett	Amnesty International
Janette de Haan	Women's Support Project
Nonnie Fisher	Scottish Rape Crisis
Florence Dioka	Meridian
Irene Graham	Councillor, Glasgow City Council
Bridget McCarthy	CLS Libraries

Artists	Telephone Interviews
Jo Hodges	Easterhouse Women's Aid
Janet Paisley	Aberlour
James McLardy	Barlinnie
Aby Vulliamy	Meridian
Magi Gibson	Barlinnie
Madeleine Conn	North Glasgow Women's Group
Alex Hetherington	Young Women's Group

Outreach Projects	Meetings
Staff team	Meridian
Staff team	218
Staff team	Young Women's Project
Staff team	Education services, HMP Barlinnie
2 clients	Meridian
3 clients	218
6 clients	HMP Barlinnie

Outreach Projects	Paper questionnaires
Clients	Young Women's Project



Open meeting for wider artist community at the Gallery of Modern Art

